BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY
3 1761 09234924 0

UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO
FACULTY OF LAW

# CRIMINAL LAW

## VOLUME 1

Professor Markus Dubber

**Fall 2012**

KE
8809
.D82
2012
v.1
c.1

BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY

AUG 14 2012

FACULTY OF LAW
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

# CRIMINAL LAW

## VOLUME 1

Professor Markus Dubber

**Fall 2012**

Digitized by the Internet Archive
in 2018 with funding from
University of Toronto

https://archive.org/details/criminallaw01dubb_0

**Table of Contents**[†]


Part I. Fundamentals & Frameworks
Chapter 1. The Province of Criminal Law*
A. Law and Police
Dubber, Police Power Model of the Criminal Process
Morris, Persons and Punishment
B. Public Law and Private Law
Dubber, Criminal Law Between Public and Private Law
1. Criminal Law and Tort Law
Linden & Feldthusen, Functions of Tort Law
— Assault in Crime and Tort
— Tort, Crime, and Compensation for Victims
2. Criminal Law and Victim Compensation Law
McMurtry Report
R. v. Cuerrier; N.C. v. W.R.B.; Re Jane Doe (CICB)
C. The Canadian Criminal Code: Past, Present, Future?
Friedland, Codification in the Commonwealth
Linden, Recodifying Canadian Criminal Law
Stephen, General View of the Criminal Law of England (1863)
Criminal Code Bill Commission, Report (1879)
Stephen, Liberty, Equality, Fraternity (1874)
Stephen, A History of the Criminal Law of England (1883)
Self-Defense: A History in Codes



Chapter 2. Theories and Concepts of Punishment **vol. 1**
A. Theories ---- 1
R. v. C.A.M. ---- 1
R. Christie ---- 13
U.S. Federal Sentencing Guidelines ---- 19
B. Concepts ---- 25
R. v. Lyons ---- 25
R. v. L.M. ---- 36
R. v. Cross ---- 41
Hörnle, Human Rights Issues ---- 55

Chapter 3. Sources and Limits of the Power to Punish ---- 57
A. POGG and Criminal Law Power ---- 57
Margarine Reference ---- 57
R. v. Hydro-Québec ---- 59
Constitution Act, 1867 (esp. ss. 91 & 92)*
Valverde, "Peace, Order, and Good Government"*


[†] Materials marked with an asterisk (*) are available on Blackboard only. All other materials appear in the bound coursebook; excerpts from the Law Reform Commission of Canada's draft criminal code (LRCC), the American Law Institute's Model Penal Code (MPC), and the German Criminal Code (StGB) can be found in the bound code supplement. Everything bound is also available online, but not vice versa.

Holy Roman Empire of the German Nation, First Imperial Police Ordinance (1530)*
N.Y. State Police Regulations, 1781-1801*
B. Harm Principle ---- 65
R. v. Malmo-Levine ---- 65
Stephen, Liberty, Equality, Fraternity ---- 72
Dubber, Rechtsgut and Harm Principle*

Chapter 4. Legality Principle (*nullum crimen sine lege*) ---- 74
A. Rule of Law/*Rechtsstaat* ---- 74
Fuller, Morality of Law
Dubber, The Principle of Legality*
B. Legislativity ---- 74
Frey v. Fedoruk ---- 74
Shaw v. DPP ---- 80
C. Specificity ---- 84
R. v. Nova Scotia Pharmaceutical Society ---- 84
R. v. Heywood ---- 91
D. Strict Construction/Lenity ---- 93
R. v. Robinson ---- 93
Heydon's Case*
R. v. Paré ---- 96
R. v. McIntosh ---- 98
R. v. Sharpe ---- 99
R. v. L.B. ---- 99
E. Prospectivity ---- 100
Application under s. 83.28 of the Criminal Code ---- 100
F. Publicity ---- 106
R. v. Furtney ---- 106
G. Codification ---- 108
United Nurses of Alberta v. Alberta ---- 108

Chapter 5. Jurisdiction ---- 118
R. v. Stucky ---- 118
Davidson v. British Columbia ---- 119
Canadian Criminal Code s. 7(2.3) ---- 125
Code of Service Discipline ---- 125
LRCC ch. 5 ---- 128
German Penal Code ---- 128

Chapter 6. Analysis of Criminal Liability ---- 132
A. Three Levels of Liability ---- 132
Dubber, Comparative Analysis of Criminal Liability ---- 133
Criminal Code Bill Commission, Report (1879) ---- 134
B. German Scheme ---- 134
Naucke, Insider's Perspective ---- 134

C. Victim Compensation Scheme---------- 136
Dubber, Analysis of Compensability ---------- 136
Compensation for Victims of Crime Act (Ont.)*
D. Tort Scheme---------- 137
Linden, Tort Defences & German Civil Code § 823 ---------- 137
E. An Application: The Queen v. Dudley and Stephens---------- 138
The Queen v. Dudley and Stephens ---------- 138

Part II. General Principles of Criminal Law ---------- 141
Chapter 7. Actus Reus (Objective Offense Elements)---------- 141
A. Actness ---------- 141
People v. Davis ---------- 141
LRCC §§ 2(2)-2(3)(a) ---------- 143
MPC §§ 1.13(5), (9), 2.01 ---------- 143
B. Voluntariness---------- 144
R. v. Larsonneur ---------- 144
R. v. Shaw ---------- 145
Martin v. State Court of Appeals of Alabama.....146
Hill v. Baxter---------- 146
LRCC § 3(1) ---------- 148
MPC § 2.01 ---------- 148
C. Omission---------- 148
R. v. Instan ---------- 148
People v. Robbins ---------- 151
State v. Miranda ---------- 153
R. v. Browne ---------- 156
Fagan v. Commissioner of Metropolitan Police ---------- 159
R. v. Miller ---------- 162
R. v. Thornton ---------- 164
LRCC § 2(3) ---------- 168
MPC § 2.01 ---------- 168
StGB § 13 ---------- 168
French Penal Code Arts. 223-6, 7 ---------- 168
StGB § 323c ---------- 169
LRCC § 10(2) ---------- 169
Quebéc Charter of Human Rights and Freedoms §§ 1, 2---------- 169
D. Possession ---------- 170
1. Significance and Variety ---------- 170
Dubber, Policing Possession ---------- 170
Possession in the Canadian Criminal Code ---------- 171
2. "Actus Reus" ---------- 172
An Act for the better preventing the counterfeiting the current coin... ---------- 173
An Act for the better prevention of offences... ---------- 174
R. v. Lennard ------ ---------- 174
R. v. Dugdale ---------- 176
LRCC § 2(3) (comment) ---------- 178

MPC § 2.01(4) ---- 178
Dubber, Policing Possession ---- 178
3. Varieties of Possession ---- 179
a. actual (physical) ---- 179
R. v. Hess - ---- 179
R. v. Beaver ---- 182
b. constructive ---- 188
(i) personal ---- 188
R. v. Christie ---- 188
(ii) joint ---- 191
R. v. Chambers ---- 191
4. Presumptions ---- 195
R. v. Oakes ---- 195
Dubber, Policing Possession ---- 202

Chapter 8. Mens Rea (Subjective Offense Elements) ---- 204
A. Voluntariness and Culpable Mental States ---- 204
In the Matter of Ronnie L. ---- 204
B. Schemes of Mental States ---- 207
C. Definitions ---- 208
LRCC § 2(4) ---- 208
MPC § 2.02, N.Y. Penal Law § 15.05 ---- 208
StGB § 15 ---- 209
StGB (Alternative Draft) §§ 17, 18 ---- 209
D. The Boundaries of Intent: Varieties of Subjective Fault ---- 210
R. v. Lewis ---- 210
R. v. Buzzanga ---- 212
MPC § 2.02(8) ---- 225
R. v. Hibbert ---- 225
R. v. Moo ---- 238
E. The Boundaries of Culpability: Subjective vs. Objective Fault ---- 242
R. v. G and another ---- 242
R. v. Tutton and Tutton ---- 249
R. v. Hundal ---- 260
R v. De Ciantis ---- 267
F. Constitutional Constraints ---- 273
1. Strict and Absolute Liability ---- 273
R. v. City of Sault Ste. Marie ---- 273
Reference Re: Section 94(2) of the Motor Vehicle Act ---- 279
R. v. Wholesale Travel Group Inc.- ---- 285
Sayre, Public Welfare Offenses ---- 311
Morissette v. United States ---- 312
MPC §§ 2.02(3), (4), 2.05 ---- 314
2. Constructive Murder ---- 314
R. v. Vaillancourt ---- 314
R. v. Martineau ---- 323

LRCC § 6(3) ---- 335
MPC §§ 210.2, .3 ---- 336
StGB § 211-213 ---- 336
3. Foreseeability ---- 337
R. v. DeSousa ---- 337
R. v. Creighton ---- 344

Chapter 9. Causation **vol. 2**
R. v. Roberts ---- 375
R. v. Pagett ---- 377
R. v. Cheshire ---- 378
R. v. Smithers ---- 383
R. v. Blaue ---- 384
R. v. Cribbin ---- 386
R. v. Nette ---- 392
R. v Sinclair ---- 407
People v. Kibbe ---- 408
LRCC § 2(6) ---- 410
MPC § 2.03 ---- 410

Chapter 10. Inchoate Crimes ---- 411
A. Attempt ---- 411
1. Concepts and Types of Attempt ---- 411
LRCC § 4(3) ---- 411
StGB §§ 22-23 ---- 411
MPC §§ 5.01, 5.05(1) ---- 411
2. Mens Rea ---- 411
R. v. Lajoie ---- 411
R. v. Ancio ---- 416
3. "Actus Reus": Incomplete Attempts ---- 421
R. v. Cline ---- 421
R. v. Sorrell and Bondett ---- 425
R. v. Deutsch ---- 430
People v. Lehnert ---- 434
4. Impossibility ---- 437
USA v. Dynar ---- 437
People v. Dlugash ---- 447
B. Counselling ---- 449
R. v. Hamilton ---- 449
LRCC § 4(4) ---- 457
MPC § 5.02 ---- 457
C. Conspiracy ---- 457
R. v. Déry ---- 457
USA v. Dynar ---- 464
LRCC § 4(5) ---- 471
MPC § 5.03(1), (5), (6) ---- 471

Chapter 11. Liability for Another's Conduct ---- 472
A. Concepts and Types of Derivative Liability ---- 472
LRCC § 4(1), 4(2) ---- 472
StGB §§ 25, 26, 27, 29 ---- 472
MPC § 2.06(1)-(3), (6)(c) ---- 472
B. Complicity ---- 472
R. v. Dunlop and Sylvester ---- 472
R. v. Popen ---- 477
R. v. Dooley ---- 480
R. v. Logan ---- 482
R. v. Kirkness ---- 489
R. v. Hibbert ---- 491
R. v. Briscoe ---- 491
R. v. Hughes ---- 496
R. v. J.F. ---- 498
C. Abandonment ---- 501
R. v. Ball ---- 501
R. v. Gonzague ---- 502
People v. Staples ---- 506
StGB § 24 ---- 507
MPC §§ 2.06(6)(c), 5.01(4), 5.02(3), 5.03(6) ---- 507
N.Y. Penal Law § 40.10 ---- 507
D. Vicarious Liability (respondeat superior) ---- 508
R. v. Hawinda Taverns Ltd. ---- 508
E. Corporate Liability ---- 510
R. v. Waterloo Mercury Sales Ltd. ---- 510
R. v. Canadian Dredge and Dock Co. Ltd. et al. ---- 510
CCC ss. 22.1 & 22.2 ---- 515
LRCC § 2(5) ---- 516
MPC § 2.07 ---- 516
People v. Congregational Khal Chaisidei Skwere, Inc. ---- 516
Weigend, "Societas delinquere non potest?" ---- 517

Chapter 12. Mistake & Intoxication ---- 525
A. Mistake ---- 525
1. Mistake of Fact ---- 525
R. v. Rees ---- 525
R. v. Metro News Ltd. ---- 527
R. v. Pappajohn ---- 531
R. v. Sansregret ---- 544
R. v. Osolin ---- 552
R. v. Ladue ---- 563
R. v. Burgess ---- 565
R. v. Vlcko ---- 565
R. v. Kundeus ---- 566

LRCC § 3(2) ---- 576
MPC § 2.04(1) ---- 576
StGB § 16 ---- 576
2. Mistake of Law ---- 576
R. v. Campbell and Mlynarchuk ---- 576
R. v. Ross ---- 580
The Statutory Instruments Act ---- 582
R. v. Molis ---- 583
R. v. Pontes ---- 586
R. v. Docherty ---- 604
People v. Coe ---- 606
R. v. Dalley ---- 608
R. v. Forster ---- 610
R. v. Jorgensen ---- 612
Lévis (City) v. Tétreault ---- 617
R. v. Pena ---- 619
LRCC § 3(7) ---- 623
MPC § 2.04(3), (4) ---- 623
StGB § 17 ---- 624
B. Intoxication ---- 624
DDP v. Beard ---- 624
DPP v. Majewski ---- 627
R. v. Bernard ---- 630
R. v. Daviault ---- 642
Canadian Criminal Code s. 33.1 ---- 662
LRCC § 3(3) ---- 663
MPC § 2.08 ---- 663
StGB § 323a ---- 663

Chapter 13. Justification **vol. 3**
A. Concepts and Types of Defense ---- 664
Blackstone, Commentaries ---- 664
Criminal Code Bill Commission, Report ---- 665
R. v. Perka ---- 665
Naucke, "An Insider's Perspective" ---- 665
LRCC ch. 3 ---- 666
N.Y. Penal Law § 25 ---- 666
Patterson v. New York ---- 666
R. v. Whyte ---- 667
B. Protection of Persons Administering and Enforcing the Law ---- 667
R. v. Brennan ---- 667
LRCC § 3(13) ---- 671
MPC §§ 3.03, 3.07 ---- 672
C. Persons in Authority ---- 672
Canadian Foundation for Children, Youth and the Law v. Canada ---- 672
LRCC § 3(14) ---- 686

MPC § 3.08 ---- 686
D. Self-Defense ---- 686
Criminal Code Bill Commission, Report*
Foliamb's Case*
R. v. Pétel ---- 686
R. v. McIntosh ---- 688
R. v. Pawliuk ---- 695
R. v. Lavallee ---- 699
R. v. Forde ---- 715
R. v. Faid ---- 719
R. v. Webers ---- 720
R. v. Baxter ---- 722
New ss. 34, 35 Criminal Code ---- 725
Bill C-26: The Citizen's Arrest and Self-defence Act*
LRCC § 3(10) ---- 727
MPC § 3.03 ---- 727
StGB §§ 32-33 ---- 727
E. Consent ---- 727
R. v. Jobidon ---- 727
R. v. Cuerrier ---- 743
R. v. Ewanchuk ---- 764
R. v. Crangle ---- 775
R. v. J.A. ---- 779
LRCC § 1(2) ---- 785
MPC § 2.11 ---- 785
F. Necessity ---- 785
The Queen v. Dudley and Stephens ---- 785
R. v. Perka ---- 785
R. v. Latimer ---- 805
LRCC § 3(9) ---- 811
MPC § 3.02 ---- 811
StGB § 34 ---- 812

Chapter 14. Excuse ---- 813
A. Incapacity ("Exemption") ---- 813
1. Insanity ---- 813
a. Definition ---- 813
R. v. Cooper ---- 813
R. v. Kjeldsen ---- 819
R. v. Abbey ---- 820
R. v. Kirkby ---- 823
R. v. Schwartz ---- 824
R. v. Chaulk ---- 829
Winko v. British Columbia (Forensic Psychiatric Institute) ---- 835
R. v. Whittle ---- 848
Stephen, 1879 Draft Bill ---- 850

Criminal Code Bill Commission, 1879 Draft Bill ---------- 851
Canadian Criminal Code, 1892 ---------- 851
Canadian Criminal Code (current) ---------- 851
LRCC § 3(6) ---------- 852
MPC § 4.01 ---------- 852
StGB § 20 ---------- 852
b. Defense (vs. Element of Liability vs. Symptom vs. Offense) ---------- 852
R. v. Saxell ---------- 852
R. v. Swain ---------- 853
c. Burden of Proof ---------- 868
R. v. Chaulk ---------- 868
People v. Kohl ---------- 889
d. Diminished Responsibility ---------- 891
R. v. More ---------- 891
R. v. Wright ---------- 894
MPC §§ 4.02, 210.3(1)(b) ---------- 897
StGB § 21 ---------- 897
e. Irresistible Impulse ---------- 897
R. v. Borg ---------- 897
2. Infancy ---------- 902
R. v. Sawchuk ---------- 902
R. v. Ogg-Moss ---------- 903
LRCC § 3(4) ---------- 909
MPC § 4.10 ---------- 909
StGB § 19 ---------- 909
3. "Insane Automatism" ---------- 909
R. v. Quick ---------- 909
R. v. Rabey ---------- 913
R. v. Parks ---------- 923
R. v. Stone ---------- 932
B. Inability ---------- 964
1. Duress ---------- 964
R. v. Carker (No. 2) ---------- 964
R. v. Hibbert ---------- 967
R. v. Ruzic ---------- 977
LRCC § 3(8) ---------- 990
MPC § 2.09 ---------- 990
StGB § 35 ---------- 990
2. Provocation ---------- 990
R. v. Hill ---------- 990
R. v. Galgay ---------- 1000
R. v. Thibert ---------- 1001
R. v. Parent ---------- 1009
MPC § 210(3)(1)(b) ---------- 1013
StGB § 213 ---------- 1013
3. Entrapment ---------- 1013

R. v. Mack ---------- 1013
R. v. Barnes ----- ---------- 1032
MPC § 2.13---------- 1042
N.Y. Penal Law § 40.05 ---------- 1042
People v. DeGina ---------- 1043
Ross, Tradeoffs in Undercover Investigations---------- 1044